

A כרמלית

כרמלית –

OVERVIEW

The names used for three of the רשויות לשבת are self explanatory. The name כרמלית however needs some clarification, why do we call it with this name. תלמוד ירושלמי offers the interpretation given in the תוספות.

בירושלמי בריש שבת¹ תני רבי חייא כרמל רך ומלא² לא לח ולא יבש אלא בינוני -

In the beginning of it is mentioned that רבי **taught** that the word 'כרמלית' stems from the word כרמל, which refers to ripening grain, for the word כרמל is comprised of two (opposite) terms: רך³, meaning soft and not yet mature, **and** מלא, meaning full and ripe. Together they convey they meaning of 'כרמל' that the grain **is neither moist nor dry, but somewhere in between -**

הכא נמי כרמלית אינו לא כרשות היחיד ולא כרשות הרבים:

Similarly here too by the רשות of a כרמלית **it is neither like a רה"י nor like a רה"ר**, but somewhere in between.⁴

SUMMARY

A כרמלית is not like a רה"י, because; a) you may not carry in it more than ד' אמות, b) you may not carry from a כרמלית to a רה"י, and c) if you transfer an object from a כרמלית to a רה"ר it is אסור only מדרבנן.

A כרמלית is not like a רה"ר, because; a) you may not carry from a כרמלית to a רה"ר even מד' אמות, and b) if you transfer an object from a כרמלית to a רה"י it is אסור only מדרבנן.

THINKING IT OVER

What other explanations are there why it is called a כרמלית?

¹ Towards the end of הלכה א (on דף ה,ב in our ירושלמי texts).

² The גורס: 'ומל' is מסורת הש"ס, not 'ומלא'.

³ The inverse of 'כר' is 'רך'.

⁴ Perhaps by expressing the idea of a כרמלית in the negative "neither moist nor dry", and "לא כרה"י ולא כרה"ר" we are given to understand that a כרמלית is not a "real" רשות. It is (a) "neither", only a מדרבנן רשות.